

Thesis presented for Ph.D. of the University
of Jabalpur. 1964

"A Comparative Study of the Concept of Liberation
in Indian Philosophy." — By Ashok Kuman Lel.

Preface: ~~WESTERN~~ Distinguishes Indian thought from Western. Unless we
turn toward spiritualism, all attempts to remove the
suffering of life are futile.

Introduction: ch. I

P. 3 — ~~चर, अर, अर, अर~~ — moral, economic, psychological, + spiritual values.
~~अर, अर, अर~~ — ~~अर~~ — ~~अर~~

ii. Moral values are not — ultimate aim; They are accor-

P. 4. pariments of spiritual life — "Humanity, no more than the
shell to be pierced, shattered + dismissed" — Zimmer
(Philosophies of India P. 232)

P. 6 — Negative ~~अर~~ is cessation of birth + death; Positives
Realization of oneness with अर — ~~अर, अर, अर~~ + ~~अर~~.

P. 16 — ~~अर, अर~~; ~~अर~~ + ~~अर~~ — Bondage — one's own imagination.

Change required is not epistemological + not ontological.
No transformation in the objective world is necessary as Shri
Anandabhai thinks.

P. 21 — Negative concepts of ~~अर~~ + ~~अर~~ — ~~अर~~ Confuses bliss with
empirical pleasures. P. 23 ~~अर~~ afraid that the soul
will lose its individuality.

Ch. II Liberation in great part

A. 37 निवृत्तिः P. 92 - Higher knowledge itself is liberation.
(Illumination)
Lower knowledge is not intellectual.

P. 35 - जीवमूर्ति in 37 निवृत्तिः; + 24 - The soul loses its name + form.
37 - Liberated is supra-moral + not-immoral. Slough
to a snake, a lotus-leaf in water. Gradual release
also described.

B. 37 निवृत्तिः - Makes room for temperamental differences

P. 41-43 Temperamentally active (in whom willip predominates
1 must perform duties for sacrifice; if feeling predominates, they
2 should, as instruments of God, offer actions to God and
surrender all fruits; if thinking predominates, free
3 himself from the notion of doership; - action done by
यत्नः.

P. 43 - निवृत्तिः can be performed not by a true ज्ञातृ, who
cannot remain so without being a मार्ग. e.g. द्विर्गता.

P. 49 - In ज्ञान + विज्ञान period ज्ञान means betterment of one's self.
in विज्ञान, it means betterment of others, = ज्ञान. So
a liberated soul continues to do actions for others, - a
point, not emphasised in 37 निवृत्तिः.

C. ब्रह्मसूत्र (ब्राह्मण) P. 56 - 37 निवृत्तिः are सुनिवृत्त containing
actual spiritual experience of ज्ञान; while ब्रह्मसूत्र is दार्शनिक
प्रयत्न or निरूपण, i.e. not an intellectual attempt.

P. 57 - 37 निवृत्तिः contain both absolutism + theism; ब्राह्मण is of a
Theist. P. 58 - ब्रह्म emphasises विद्वत्

Ch. IV. Jainism (Liberation)

3

P. 62 - ^{Every} Soul - अनंत, अनंत, अनंत, + अनंत -
the ^{of} absolute. P. 66 - the cause of bondage.
P. 67 - अनंत अनंत अनंत | P. 72 - No strength; P. 76 - No grace;
P. 77 - अनंत अनंत अनंत [akin to अनंत]. P. 82 - Bondage real,
then liberation a pseudo-concept; for what is real cannot
be destroyed. P. 84 - historians say that women cannot get
liberation!

Ch. IV Liberation in Pratyakha + Spiritual Buddhism.

P. 94 - निर्वाण = i) annihilation; ii) inexpressible state;
iii) eternal, pure + infinite consciousness.

P. 100 - अनंत 203, - निर्वाण, the highest freedom + happiness;
Happiness here + hereafter (अनंत अनंत अनंत).

103 - Beautiful description of निर्वाण:-

अनंत 385 - "It is difficult to understand the path
of one who has attained निर्वाण". Exactly in Upanishadic terms
we get in अनंत, "water, fire, air, earth do not reach
there. The light of stars, sun & moon cannot reach there".

104 - "No measure measures him" - Buddha. cf. अनंत
How can the Known be known?

105-106 - Rhy. David describes निर्वाण:- intellectually,
it is light, truth, saving knowledge; emotionally happiness;
volitionally, freedom". Keita: - "The soul, in निर्वाण

अनंत:- Returns back to its primitive source"

111 - निर्वाण is absolutely unmixed bliss.
113 - Not an unconscious state. P. 114 - अनंत

+ अनंत imply removal of अनंत + non-emergence
of them in निर्वाण. P. 116 P. Murti - निर्वाण is an अनंत
अनंत + so also for P. Stacherbatsky, - a sort of
noumenal unconditioned reality.

Ch. V Hith in Hith Hith

P. 127 - शुद्ध चेतना - Pure Consciousness is the reality.

P. 124 - What is relatively great & transcendent is शुद्ध transcendently. ~~It is~~ viewed sub specie ~~et~~ aeternitatis is शुद्ध. Viewed through the glasses of causality, it is शुद्ध, + when causality is abstracted it is शुद्ध.

P. 135 - When शुद्ध is attained, there is no dualism of logic, Ethics or Epistemology. Reality is indeterminate (अज्ञेय), + all Determinations are negations.

शुद्ध चेतना: P. 136 - अज्ञेय - Storehouse of Consciousness behind the momentary manifestations. P. 139 - To शुद्ध bondage & liberation are both thought-concepts + equally false.

P. 141 - शुद्ध - positive description - is pure, good, eternal.

P. 150 - To शुद्ध - शुद्ध + शुद्ध are both real.

शुद्ध - शुद्ध real शुद्ध unreal.

शुद्ध - शुद्ध is unreal, शुद्ध real

शुद्ध - Both are unreal.

To शुद्ध - Both are real.

P. 152 - To शुद्ध - शुद्ध is destruction of शुद्ध

To शुद्ध - " " " as also शुद्ध

So the knowledge of शुद्ध destroys शुद्ध.

Individual vs universal salvator

शुद्ध vs. शुद्ध.

Ch. VI Liberation in शुद्ध + शुद्ध

P. 161 - Doubts - शुद्ध, शुद्ध, + शुद्ध make liberation an ideal, & pious wish. P. 162 - शुद्ध answer: - It is these defects which make a man disgusted + renounce the world - a stage beyond शुद्ध, which would have not been mentioned if the doubts were final + difficulties irremovable

P. 164 - 3 stages of liberation: 1. from adventitious qualities, & this is possible after right knowledge of the soul. 167 - Letter of the theist. (H. 1.)

P. 168 - Cause of bondage is embodiment per se. Therefore stages a contradiction in terms (cf. Smig). Stages says both stages & performance of duty are essential for liberation.

P. 169 - stages also recognized as means. P. 170 - Bondage

real; then our criticism is that liberation is impossible. It is interesting to note that the six ^{perfects of} qualities of God, majesty, power, glory, beauty, knowledge & freedom, are not attained by soul in liberation. It only exists; stages + liberation not possible. P. 172 - No difference between stages + liberation.

Then as stages say, even this liberation is better.

Stages (in Harvard XVII, 75) says stages + liberation are appropriate names for founders who give the concept of liberation.

P. 178-179

Stages - Stages's view resembles that of stages.

Stages accepts stages's view that the soul is unconscious, but says that consciousness is a modal change (stages) in the self. Stages is neither the essence nor an accidental quality. A substance it is unconscious, as modes it is conscious. It is characterized by the potency to know; & this potential consciousness exists even in the state of liberation.

P. 180 -

→ Stages, stages & even stages do not think of liberation. Stages however belongs to the transitional stage of liberation when liberation was started to be recognized. liberation to him is cessation of bad, & of merits & demerits, pains & pleasures.

P. 182 - The soul merely exists. Obligatory action & knowledge are both recognized by stages as means to attain liberation.

Ch. VII liberation in atithi view — Ethical view.

- P.192 — original atithi — अतिथि is वैयर्थ्य, conquering रहित + रहित
Classical " (१ संसार) — it is सिद्धांत अवस्था. Metaphysical view.
193 — This transition is like one between मीमांसा + वैयर्थ्य
194 — Discriminative knowledge — नास्ति, तस्मै नास्ति (वि. अ. 64).
196 — atithi believes ^{both} in मीमांसा + वैयर्थ्य > both like a potter's wheel which moves due to momentum (संसार)
197 — Who disjoins whom? युक्ति is inactive. P.198 — युक्ति binds + frees which both are phenomenal, or मिथ्या (akin to Vedānta view. 199).
200 — Rituals (cf. Jainism + Buddhism) and postpone + not root out evil. 201 — Knowledge removes ignorance; devotion has no role. 204 — Bondage acc. to वि. consists in perceiving identity, which acc. to अ. it consists in difference.
P.205 — If अ. is beginningless अतिथि, how can evolution be real?
P.206 — So what is necessary is not transformation of phenomena, but transvaluation of one's own nature — वि. Confuses bliss with empirical pleasure which is due to तत्त्व. अ. is 1st stage, वि. the 2nd, + अ. the third.

Ch. VIII Liberation in अति. अ.

- P.212 — The world, as dream to the dreamer, is real for all our phenomenal activities, morality + religion included.
Adv. criticisms against अ. are based on not understanding
+ Diff. between संशय + निश्चय points of view.
P.217-218 अति is the discovery of an already existing fact (P.220 — i.e. अवस्था, + not अवस्था like वि.)
P.226 — Moral virtues become the very nature of the liberated — अवस्था — morality necessary, but not enough for अति. P.227 — Even an inquiry into the nature of अ. requires अवस्था.
P.230 — Had there been no अति there would be no teachers of knowledge (i.e. experience of अति).
P.232 — Acc. to some अ. only अति of अति is removed by अति + not अति.
P.234. Prof. S.S. Shastri. thinks that अति is only a legacy from वि.; for अति destroys अति but not अति. But Shastri, अति must remove both. 245 — Change brought about by अति is only in our relational consciousness, + not in the objective world.

Ch. IV Liberato in tempo.

P. 252 - Soul, a real agent, & a part of $\pi\pi\pi$ or attribute,
connected by inner inseparability. P. 255 - This is not the view,
acc. to which identity & diff. are both real. it is $\pi\pi\pi\pi\pi\pi$ i.e.
Identity qualified by difference. $\pi\pi$ is with shows identity of ground.

P. 256 - It traces again to the. No self - idea, but self - idea. P. 259 - the
is the hunger which the lord + soul mutually feel for each other, +
even here, the soul does not lose its individuality. It holds

then it is equally & not individually - which is opposed to H. H. -
P. 262 - The liberated enjoys all powers of God except of creation etc.
& of imparting grace. P. 265 - John & John are contradictions.

p. 266 - Why not ^{recognize} ~~say~~ that for St. the ~~stranger~~ is one who looks on his
body as a slough to a snake, though to on-lookers it appears
to be real? St. does not see the truth of this.

P. 270 — Direct cause of Fit is higher with (सर्वज्ञानवृत्त); Fit is knowledge of one's own position in the organism of God.

Ch. X Liberation in महावक्त्रांत

P. 279 - This is untainted innately bliss: white + green are means.

P. 282 - म. material, + God efficient cause. Here like 21. oppose
निमित्तकारण. P. 285 - Soul, an agent in itself + मुक्ति. Bondage is real.

P. 292 - सुलभता. P. 294 - प्रका. is uncertain regarding तीव्रता. P. 295 -

Bliss of no two souls is equal. That simply transfers the distinction of
time to the state of liberation. 1296 - To know God, we must have
His grace + meditate Him on असु. 299 - मक्ति is an end-in-itself.
It is beautiful + appears

Ch. XI Liberators in विद्रोह + क्रांति

P. 307 - Tiaqin does justice to all Latin passages by his translation of them.

Three equal co-eternal realities - $\text{ज्ञात्} \text{ज्ञात}, + \text{ज्ञात} - \text{ज्ञात} = \text{ज्ञान}$
 P. 208 - immanent + transcendent, giver of fruits. ज्ञात is knowable +
 The possessor of knowable, just as sun is light + its source.

Soul atomic in size, the real agent even while liberated. 8
P.310 - a part of Him; wave + sea, serpent + its coil.

P.311 - Liberation = शक्तिरूपी + स्वतन्त्रता, similar to nature of
शक्ति + development of ones own individuality. P.313 - Does
not believe in स्वतन्त्रता like शक्ति, even in स्वतन्त्रता but soul does
not lose individuality. P.314 - It is not extinction but extension
of individuality, no शक्ति. P.316-17 - शक्ति-स्वतन्त्रता, शक्ति, स्वतन्त्रता
(स्वतन्त्रता - स्वतन्त्रता + स्वतन्त्रता शक्तिरूपी), शक्ति that Lord will protect,
स्वतन्त्रता or स्वतन्त्रता - Given as the intermediary - these five
are the means of शक्ति. P.318 - स्वतन्त्रता like शक्ति, शक्ति to him is special
love of his Lord, + not स्वतन्त्रता. And still शक्ति requires grace.
P.319 - Criticism the same as against शक्ति + शक्ति. Yet, the relation
of शक्ति-स्वतन्त्रता - शक्ति, the secret, deserves praise.

P.320 - स्वतन्त्रता of शक्ति - शक्ति pure, devoid of शक्ति, = शक्ति-स्वतन्त्रता - grace
of शक्ति, it is the spiritual rising or growing. (wrong to depict enjoyment)
P.322 - शक्ति the real agent + not one as it were like in it, शक्तिरूपी शक्ति
Spider + its web. P.324 - Souls as sparks of fire, atomic in size,
a part, + not reflection. P.325 - शक्ति + शक्ति - Ring gold dependent
on gold, born hip of the same nature. P.328 - Rejects शक्ति if no
love. P.329 - शक्ति is for शक्तिरूपी where effort counts; शक्तिरूपी for
शक्तिरूपी where grace counts. P.330 - शक्ति afraid, like शक्ति. + losing
individuality in शक्ति.

Ch. XII शक्ति + his followers. P.331 - शक्ति (Intuitive felt) शक्ति.
P.340 - शक्ति, शक्ति means God is more than the qualities. Cannot be indeterminate
because He is perceived. P.343 - Bondage = turning ones face away.
P.345 - rejects शक्ति, for no love. 346 - शक्ति continues to worship. As water
Cannot remain without earth as being, so शक्ति cannot without शक्ति.
P.348 - शक्ति who in शक्ति + शक्तिरूपी, individuality not lost. P.351 - शक्ति The
highest शक्ति (शक्ति, शक्ति, शक्ति, शक्ति + शक्ति). P.356 -

Ch. XIII Sri Anubindo. P.359 - Big undying change. Absolute does not become
Subject to limitation. P.360 - Evolution - a self-willed plunge in ignorance, evolves
return to Him; P.362 - Integration, an ascent through descent. Both off and
grace. P.364 - शक्ति prepares the heart to receive. P.367 - No conflict between personal
+ universal good. P.369 - Gnostic gives value to others + not vice versa. P.371 -
Pair transformed into शक्ति. P.376 - शक्तिरूपी + शक्तिरूपी diff. bet. शक्तिरूपी + शक्ति
- P. R. V. Ramade. P.378 - शक्तिरूपी comes into removing शक्तिरूपी; Anubindo is
transformation of it; epistemological vs. ontological.

Cases prescribed under each paper.

- Paper I- (i) The Buckingham and Carnatic Co.Ltd.
Vs. Their Workmen (1951-52) IFJ 265.
- (ii) All India Bank Employees' Association
Vs. Industrial Tribunal (1961-62) Vol.21
IFJ.63.
- iii) Inland Navigation Workers Union in Re.A.I.R.
1936 Cal.57.
- iv) R.S.Rinkar Vs. Emperor A.I.R. 1935
Nag. 143.

Paper II-(i) Birdhichand Sharma Vs.First Civil Judge
Nagpur (1960-61) XX IFJ 73.

(ii) Alembic Chemical WorksCo. Ltd. Vs.
Their Workmen (1960-61) XX IFJ 78.

(iii) Gemini Studio Madras Vs. The State
(1952) IV IFJ 329.

Paper IV-(i) Express Newspaper (Pri.Ltd.) Vs.Union of
India (1958-59) XIV IFJ.41.

(ii) Rashtriya Mill Mazdoor Sangh Bombay Vs.
Mill Owners Association Bombay (1952-53)
IV IFJ. 133.

(iii) Aurashtra Salt Mfg. Co. Vs. Bai Valu Raja
& Others (1958-59) XIV IFJ 351.